POSITIONING AHL AL-BAYT WITHOUT TENDENCIES

AL-SHAWKANI'S CONTRIBUTION TO DETERMINING THE HADITH IN ISLAMIC LAW

Ahmad Azmi Ahsantu Dhonni
UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
daniazmi21@gmail.com

Muhid
UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
muhid@uinsby.ac.id

Andris Nurita
UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
Zulfimaulida64@gmail.com

Afif Maulana
UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
afifmaul21@gmail.com

Abstract

Shiites tend to prioritize Ahl al-Bayt's position in transmitting Hadith. It affects the determination of Hadith as a primary source in Islamic Sharia. The Zaydi Maddhab, the Shi'a branch, is very dominant in Yemen. However, al-Shawkani, educated by his father and his Zaydist teachers, has a different view from Zaydism in positioning Ahl al-Bayt. Al-Shawkani saw that the uncertain political conditions in Yemen and the rise of blind taqlid directed Muslims to go astray and heresy at that time. This study examines al-Shawkani's stance on Ahl al-Bayt's position in determining the basis of Sharia law through his relevant works. Therefore, this socio-historical investigation also reveals the contribution of al-Shawkani thought in Islamic studies. This research shows that although al-Shawkani was influenced by Zaydism, objectively, he did not prioritize Ahl al-Bayt and was not passionate about one particular madhhab—a stance often opposed by Yemen's

Zaydist scholars. In his works, al-Shawkani indirectly agrees with the opinion of Sunni scholars in determining the narrators of the Hadith as the primary source for deciding Islamic Sharia law. Thus, the contribution of al-Shawkani, who positions Hadith narrators objectively and scientifically, both Ahl al-Bayt and non-Ahl al-Bayt, is set the same as the criteria most scholars of Hadith experts determined.

Keywords: *Ahl al-Bayt, the Zaydi Shi'a, al-Shawkani, Narrators of Hadith.*

Introduction

Al-Shawkani is one of the Yemeni Islamic scholars who had exciting thoughts to study in his time, even today. His critical and objective thinking is often the main attraction for studies by Muslims from various groups discussing Islam from multiple aspects. Al-Shawkani is closely related to the Zaydiyyah Shi'a madhhab because he was born in a Zaydi milieu. His father was a Zaydis figure who also greatly influenced al-Shawkani. Al-Shawkani's father directed his scientific development to only one madhhab. It was due to the consideration of Yemen's political conditions, which were considered rebels by the Ottoman Turks. It also affected most Yemeni scholars, who preferred *taqlid* to their schools of thought.[1]

However, it differs from al-Shawkani, who has a firm personality and is not satisfied with learning just by reading literature. He developed his knowledge from many scholars. It influences al-Shawkani's character as a scholar who has the authority to deter-

mine shari'a directly to the Qur'an and Hadith without being bound by madhhab.

Al-Shawkani's thinking, which influenced Zaydism, is certainly interesting for further discussion on determining sources of Islamic law (Hadith). Shi'a prioritizes narrators (*rawi*) from Ahl al-Bayt, especially in the narration of Hadiths, contrary to the Sunni group. The Zaydi madhhab is a branch of the Shi'a sect that tends to be more moderate than others. It is significant to study because it affects the narrators of Hadith, apart from Ahl al-Bayt, in determining the basis of Islamic law, which al-Shawkani considered.[2]

Indeed, considering his works and his rigid study of *manhaj fiqh*, al-Shawkani is better known as a jurist (*fuqaha'*) rather than a traditionalist (*muhaddithin*). Although not much in his work explicitly discusses the Hadith in-depth, his comments can indirectly prove that his objective thinking dis-

---

[1] Harun Nasution, *Teologi Islam: Aliran-Aliran Sejarah Analisa Perbandingan* (Jakarta: UI Press, 1983), 13-14.

[2] Muhammad Imran, "Sahabat Nabi SAW dalam Prespektif Sunni dan Shi'ah: Pengaruhnya pada Kesahihan Hadis," *Aqlam: Journal of Islam and Plurality* 1, no. 1 (June 2016): 27-28, DOI: 10.30984/ajip.v1i1.497.

cusses Hadith, such as the method of using Sahih Hadith (authentic) as *tarjih* (the primary preference priority) for other sources of Islamic law, and his references to the collected works of Hadith scholars such as Imam al-Bukhari and Imam al-Muslim. So in this way, this can be used as evidence of how al-Shawkani positions Ahl al-Bayt and whether or not they are prioritized in determining Hadith.

Several researchers analyzed al-Shawkani's thoughts, such as Zainuddin[3] and Rizal[4] in their respective studies, analyzed al-Shawkani's *Nayl al-Awtar: Sharh Muntaqa al-Akbar* from the perspective of Hadith science. Meanwhile, Rifai explained the essence of al-Shawkani's thoughts and *manhaj* of Hadith science.[5] In addition, Atabik made it clear that al-Shawkani had an objective mind of a narrator (*rawi*) from Ahl al-Bayt.[6]

Furthermore, al-Shawkani, in his assertion that Hadith is one of the primary sources in determining Islamic sharia, proves the consistency of his thinking in producing concrete legal products. Thus, this study analyzes descriptively and socio-historically analysis of al-Shawkani's thoughts on the position of Ahl al-Bayt as a narrator of Hadith and his contribution to determining Islamic sharia.

Exploring al-Shawkani's Thought and Its Socio-historical Context

His full name is Muhammad ibn 'Ali ibn Muhammad ibn 'Abdullah ibn al-Hasan ibn Muhammad ibn Sholah ibn Ibrahim ibn Muhammad al-Afif ibn Muhammad ibn Marzuq al-Shawkani al-Shan'ai.[7] "Al-Shan'a" refers to his residence, while "al-Shawkani" refers to Shawkan, his homeland—a town quite close to San'a. Al-Shawkani was born on Monday, 28 Zulqa'dah 1173 AH, and died at 76 on Wednesday, 27 Jumadil Akhir 1250 AH, at the Khuzaimah cemetery in San'a.[8]

[3] Zainuddin MZ, "Metode Kritis al-Shawkani dalam Kitab Nayl al-Awtar," *Islamica* 3, no. 2 (March 2009): 90-100, DOI: 10.15642/islamica.2009.3.2.90-100.

[4] Fauzi Rizal, "Metode Imam asy-Shawkani dalam Menyusun Kitab Nailul Autar: Syarh Muntaqal-Akhbar," *Studi Multidisipliner: Jurnal Kajian Keislaman* 5, no. 2 (2018): 41-55, DOI: 10.24952/multidisipliner.v5i2.1113.

[5] Masyhuri Rifai, Muhammad Abd Aziz, and Fariz Risky Fatah, "Studi Komparasi Manhaj al-Shawkani (Fawaid al-Majmu'ah fi al-Ahadis al-Maudu'ah) dan al-Idlibi (Naqd al-Matn; 'Inda 'Ulama al-Hadis an-Nabawi)," *Zawiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 7, no. 1 (July 2021): 101-120. DOI: 10.31332/zjpi.v7i1.2900 .

[6] Ahmad Atabik, "Tarjih dalam Penafsiran

al-Qur'an Perspektif Imam asy-Shawkani dalam Tafsir asy-Shawkani," *Hermeneutik: Jurnal Ilmu al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 9, no. 2 (2016): 287-312, DOI: 10.21043/hermeneutik.v9i2.873.

[7] Syibli Syarjaya, "Pemikiran Ushul Fiqh al-Syawkani: Telaah terhadap Kitab Irsyad al-Fuluhul ila Tahqiq min 'Ilm al-Ushul," *Jurnal al-Qalam* 24, no. 3 (2007): 354, DOI: 10.32678/alqalam.v24i3.1663.

[8] Nur Moklis, "Studi tentang Pemikiran Imam al-Syawkani dalam Kitab Irsyad al-

His father, Ali al-Shawkani, was a judge in Yemen who had been trusted by Imam Qasimiyyah (Yemen's Zaydis Dynasty) for 40 years.[9] Al-Shawkani's father, one of the well-known Zaydis figures, was the first to introduce Zaydism and educate him in a milieu influenced by this madhhab.[10]

Al-Syaukani has qualified intelligence. Since he was ten, he has memorized the Qur'an and its understanding.[11] At the age of 20, he was asked by many people for his *fatwa* on complex fiqh issues. At 30, he left *taqlid* and then fully practiced *ijtihad*, which directly adhered to the Qur'an and Hadith without any restrictions on madhhab, including Zaydism.

Al-Shawkani was always dissatisfied with learning from the books of previous scholars; he felt it necessary to discuss the book with some other scholars. One of the scholars who are most often concerned with him about the *Sahihain*

(*Sahih al-Bukhari and al-Muslim*) and its explanations (*shrah*), the *mustalah al-hadith, usul al-fiqh, Bahr al-Zahar*, and his *sharh*, is 'Abdul al-Qadir ibn Ahmad, whose knowledge was recognized by his father.[12]

Although initially al-Shawkani was limited by his father in pursuing knowledge in his madhhab, he later achieved the priesthood (*imam*) category in Hadith science for performing *talaqqi* to 33 ulama.[13] Based on al-Shawkani's expertise as a *mujtahid*, his imam degree is convincing in Hadith. Some of al-Shawkani's teacher-scholars include Ahmad ibn 'Amir al-Hada'i (1127–1197 AH), Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn al-Harazi, Isma'il ibn al-Hasan ibn Ahmad ibn al-Hasan ibn al-Imam al-Qasam ibn Muhammad (1120–1206 AH), 'Abdullah ibn Isma'il al-Nahmi (1150–1228 AH), al-Qasim ibn Yahya al-Haulani (1162–1209 AH), Al-Hasan ibn Isma'il al-Maghribi (1162–1207 AH), 'Ali ibn Hadi 'Urhab, 'Abd al-Qadir ibn Ahmad al-Kawkabani (1135–1207 AH), Hadi ibn Husain al-Qarini, and Yusuf ibn Muhammad al-Hanafi.[14]

The students of al-Shawkani include Ahmad ibn 'Abd Allah al-Damdi (1174–1222 AH), 'Ali ibn Ahmad ibn Muhsin al-Haymi (1170–1240 AH), Husayn ibn Muhasin al-Sab'i al-Ansari al-Yamani, Muhammad ibn Hasan al-Shajni al-Dam-

---

Fuhul," accessed June 21, 2023, https://www.academia.edu/41609815/STUDI_TENTANG_PEMIKIRAN_AL_SHAWKANI_DALAM_IRSYAD_AL_FUHUL.

[9] Moch. Zulkarnain Muis, "Ihdad dalam Hukum Islam: Studi Komparasi Pemikiran Imam al-Bajuri dan Imam al-Shawkani," *Ma'mal: Jurnal Laboratorium Syariah dan Hukum* 3, no. 03 (June 2022): 206, DOI: 10.15642/mal.v3i3.137.

[10] Ahmad Atabik, "Penafsiran al-Shawkani terhadap Ayat-ayat Aqidah," *Hermeneutik: Jurnal Ilmu al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 10, no 1 (2016): 156, DOI: 10.21043/hermeneutik.v10i1.3907.

[11] Syarjaya," Pemikiran Ushul Fiqh al-Syawkani," 354.

[12] Syarjaya.

[13] Muis, "Ihdad dalam Hukum Islam," 207.

[14] Al-Syawkani, *Irsyadul Fuhul,* 16.

mari, 'Abd al-Haqq ibn Fadl al-Hindi, al-Sharif al-Imam Muhammad ibn Nasir al-Hazimi, al-Sayyid Ahmad ibn 'Ali, Sayyid Muhammad ibn Muhammad Zabarah al-Yamani al-San'ani (d. 1381 AH/ 1962 AD), Muhammad ibn Ahmad al-Sudi (1178–1226 AH), Muhammad ibn Ahmad Musim al-Sa'di al-Sa'ani (1186–1223 AH), al-Sayyid Ahmad ibn 'Ali ibn Muhsin ibn al-Imam al-Mutawakkil 'ala Allah Isma'il ibn al-Qasim (1150–1223 AH), al-Sayyid Muhammad ibn Muhammad Hashim ibn Yahya al-Shami (1178–1251 AH), 'Abd al-Rahman, Ibn Ahmad al-Balkali al-Damdi (1180–1227 AH), and al-Shawkani's two sons: al-'Allamah 'Ali ibn Muhammad al-Shawkani, al-Qadi Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Shawkani.[15]

The literature that al-Shawkani studied included *al-Azhar* (from Imam al-Mahdi), *Muhtashar al-Faraidh* (from al-'Ushaifiri), *al-Millah* (from al-Hariri), *al-Kafiyah wa al-Syafiyyah and Muhtashar al-Muntaka* (from Ibn Haib), *al-Tadhhib* (from al-Taftazani), *al-Tahis* and *al-Ghayah* (from Ibn Imam al-Mahdi), *Adab al-Bahth wa al-Munazarah, Mandumat al-Jazzari* (in the Qiraat), *Mandumat al-Jazzar* (from Imam al-'Adhudh).[16] Al-Shawkani has studied many other works of literature but is unsatisfied with reading them. He often discussed the reading results with his teachers to develop the

knowledge he had learned through literature from scholars. It becomes al-Shawkani's personality to become a scholar with thoughts not confined by madhhab, especially Zaydism.

Al-Shawkani's thoughts have contributed scientifically to various Islamic scholarship. Al-Shawkani's works discuss from a theoretical aspect around 200 titles covering varied religious knowledge needed by human life. His works were published with *tahqiq* and tashih processes such as *Ibtal Da'wa al-Ijma' 'ala Mutlaq al-Samah* (1328 AH), *Ittihaf al-Akabir bi Isnad al-Dafatir* (1328 AH), *Irsyad al-Siqat ila Ittifaq al-Syarai' 'ala al-Tauhid wa al-Ma'ad wa al-Nubuwah* (1395 AH), *Irsyad al-Fuhul ila Tahqiq al-Haqq min 'Ilm al-Usul* (1347 H), *Irsyad al-Sail ila Dalil al-Sail* (1395 H), *Isykal al-Sail ila Tafsir wa al-Qadr Qaddarnahu Manazil* (1395 AH), *Fath al-Qadir: Al-Jami' baina Fannay al-Riwayah wa al-Dirayah fi 'Ilm al-Tafsir* (1383 AH), and others.[17]

Furthermore, in the science of Hadith, al-Shawkani also wrote a *sharh* for the collection book of Hadith, *Muntaqa al-Ahbar,* by Ibn Taimiyyah.[18] Other works on Hadith compiled by al-Shawkani are *Nazl man al-Ittaqa bi Kasyf Ahwal al-Muntaqa: Mukhtasar min Nayl al-Awtar*

---

[15] Zainuddin, "Metode Kritis al-Shawkani," 94.

[16] Syarjaya, "Pemikiran Ushul Fiqh al-Syawkani," 354.

[17] Achmad Mukarramah, "Fath al-Qadir Karya al-Imam al-Syawkani: Suatu Kajian Metodologi" (Thesis, UIN Alauddin Makassar, 2015), 92.

[18] Zainuddin, "Metode Kritis al-Shawkani," 95.

(1197 AH) and *Al-Fawaid al-Majumu'ah fi al-Ahadis al-Maudu'ah* (1203 AH)—which was republished by Matbaah al-Muhammadiyah in 1380 AH.[19] Although al-Shawkani's works on hadith were not numerous, these books were widely used as references and studied by scholars of his time and after.

Al-Shawkani and Zaydism

Al-Shawkani's life was influenced by the uncertain political conditions in the 18th century AD, the middle era of Muslim decline. The three major empires (Ottoman, Safavid, and Mughal) experienced a decline from their glory. The kings of the Ottoman Empire had difficulty dealing with many rebellions because of the vast territory and being heavily influenced by the princesses in the kingdom.[20] As a part of the Ottoman Empire, Yemen rebelled against the Ottoman Turks led by al-Qasim ibn Muhammad. It continued even when the Yemeni leader, whom al-Mu'ayyan Muhammad ibn al-Qasim replaced, succeeded in defending Yemen from the Ottoman Turks.[21]

This situation influenced the development of Islamic scholarship in Yemen. Al-Shawkani admits that Yemen has experienced stagnation in the development of science since the 4th century, so Muslims practice *taqlid* (parroting) in their

faith. *Bid'ah* (innovation in religion) and *khurafat* (superstition) have deviated Muslims from Sharia in this chaotic situation.[22] This condition required al-Shawkani to study intensively and enlarge his scientific horizons.

At that time, Yemen was dominated by Zaydism. As mentioned, al-Shawkani was educated by his father and Zaydis clerics since childhood. He also studied the basic teachings of Zaydi Madhhab, which his father designed. However, al-Shawkani also studied literature other than Zaydism, including Sunni.

Al-Shawkani studied the books of Usul al-Fiqh al-Syafi'i, Jalaluddin al-Mahalli's *Sharh Jam'u al-Jawami'* under the guidance of al-Hasan ibn Ismail al-Maghribi. He also studied Ibn Hajar al-Athqalani's *Bulugh al-Maram* and many other Sunni literatures, either self-taught or under the direction of his teachers. It causes al-Shawkani to have thoughts not determined by one madhhab—some of the Shi'a scholars are more old-fashioned (*jumud*) or *taqlid* and refuse to study literature other than that of Shi'a.[23] Extensive literary sources and open-mindedness constructed al-Shawkani produce typical and comprehensive thoughts, often attracting attention to learn from other Shi'a scholars.

---

[19] Mukarramah, "Fath al-Qadir," 92.

[20] Nasution, *Teologi Islam*, 13-14.

[21] Nasution, 78.

[22] Nasrun Rusli, *Konsep Ijtihad asy-Syawkânî dan Relevansinya dengan Pembaharuan Hukum di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Logos, 1999), 56.

[23] Al-Syawkani, *Nayl al-Awtar: Muntaqa al-Akhbar, Juz 1* (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1961), 215.

The Position of Ahl al-Bayt for Shi'a Zaydi

Ahl al-Bayt is defined as those forbidden to receive *zakah* from families descended from Bani Hasyim or Bani Muttalib. Shi'a and Sunnis agree on the obligation of Muslims to glorify Ahl al-Bayt (the family of the Prophet Muhammad). Unlike the transmission of Hadith, Shi'a prioritizes Ahl al-Bayt narrators over Sunni, who still judge narrators according to the five requirements of the validity of Hadith: narrators must be fair, intelligent, *sanad* must be connected, not have *'illat* (having reprehensible habits), and there is no doubt (*syadz*) in the *sanad* and *matan* of the Hadith.[24] The difference in the criteria for Hadith's transmission between Sunni and Shi'a can be seen in the Ahad Hadith. In the case of this Hadith, Shi'a accepts narrations from Ahl al-Bayt absolutely—without considering the narrator's condition.

Shi'a formulate several conditions in accepting Ahad Hadith, such as the narrators are their group, can be trusted, their opinion is correct, narrates Hadith from the Prophet Muhammad or Ahl al-Bayt, and no *qarinah* (reasonable, following the Qur'an or Mutawatir Hadith's meaning, and factual actions from

the priests) that support the transmission. Shi'a believes that Ahl al-Bayt is *ma'shum* (protected from mistakes), so Ahl al-Bayt is prioritized after the Prophet in transmitting the Ahad Hadith as long as the narrator is trustworthy, never lies and does good deeds.[25] Thus, this confirms that Shi'a prioritized the Hadith narrators from Ahl al-Bayt because of the *ma'shum* degree of these narrators.

In contrast to Ahl al-Bayt, Shi'a refuse to generalize the concept of *'adalah* (righteous; morally right) to the Companions as narrators (*rawi*). Shi'a relies on the substance of the objective shari'a that all humans can make mistakes. Shi'a rejects the concept of equality for all Companions because not all Companions violate the Shari'a during their lifetime; therefore, any dishonest Companions will be dismissed as narrators of Hadith, while the honest Companions will be accepted for their transmission.[26]

Shi'a's indifference to the Companions also influences their view of the equality of the Companions in the transmission of Hadith. In the Shi'a handbook, *Al-Rawda min al-Kafi*," it is mentioned that humans have left Islam after the death of the Prophet, except for three Companions: al-Miqdad ibn al-Aswad, Abu Dhar al-Ghiffari, and Salman al-Farisi. In addition to the narration of

---

[24] MA. Zuhurul Fuqohak, "Riwayat Ahli Bait dalam Dunia Tafsir: Studi Komparasi Tafsir ar-Riwa'i dan Tafsir bi al-Ma't," *Heurmeneutik: Jurnal Ilmu al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 13, no. 1 (2019): 4, DOI: 10.21043/hermeneutik.v13i1.5523.

[25] Fuqohak, 4-5.

[26] Imran, "Sahabat Nabi SAW.," 27-28.

the Hadith from the three Companions, they were rejected.[27] This Shi'a stance is consistent with their initial concept. The glorification (*ma'shum*) of their Imams and Ahl al-Bayt proves the subjectivity of their judgment. It shows that the priority position of Ahl al-Bayt as a narrator has a significant influence.

Al-Shawkani's understanding of Zaydi Shi'a tends to be Sunni, which is more moderate than other Shi'a adherents. Zaydi Shi'a defines the Hadith in *the Kutub al-Sunnah* as Sahih Hadith and makes it the primary source of sharia. The Zaydi do not discriminate among Hadith experts in their acceptance of narrators judged acceptable (*adil*) from different madhhabs or narrators from Ahl al-Bayt. It differs from the Shi'a Imamiya, which rejects honest narrators from different madhhabs.[28] Thus, Zaydism tends not to prioritize Ahl al-Bayt as an honest narrator rather than narrators from other Companions. It is also similar to al-Shawkani's understanding, although, in the end, he could formulate his thoughts without distinguishing between madhhabs. Al-Shawkani developed his knowledge with a more objective analysis, as seen in most of his works, not to prejudice certain madhhab, including Zaydism.

Positioning the Narrators of Ahl al-Bayt

Al-Shawkani is an influential Muslim figure who has freedom of thought. Al-Shawkani assumed that the people of his time had deviated from Islamic sharia by adopting blind taqlid, practiced mainly by the community and religious leaders, neglecting the primary sources of Islam. Al-Shawkani has evoked the purification of Islamic law by clarifying various issues accompanied by valid arguments to exclude unacceptable worship (such as heresy) practiced by people. For example, al-Shawkani's *Al-Sail al-Jirar wa al-Mutadaqiq 'ala Hada'iq al-Azhat* obtained pro and contra responses from traditional scholars. They competed to refute and attack al-Shawkani; they even made counter-books to deny al-Shawkani's work.[29]

Furthermore, Al-Shawkani wrote *Sharh al-Azhar* as a broader elaboration of the chosen Ahl al-Bayt fiqh to revive the Muslims so they do not carry out reprehensible *taqlid* by presenting legal arguments. According to him, stagnation and blind *taqlid* distorted the Muslim faith in the 4th century Hijriah. Therefore, he also issued a fatwa forbidding *taqlid*, which caused people to apostate and *shirk*. As a result, al-Shawkani was criticized, slandered, and accused of under-

---

[27] Imran, 28.

[28] Mahmud Basuni Faudah, *Tafsir-tafsir Al-Quran Pengenalan dengan Metodologi Tafsir* (Bandung: Pustaka, 1987), 238.

[29] Syarjaya, "Pemikiran Ushul Fiqh al-Syawkani," 355.

mining Ahl al-Bayt.[30] Historically, in determining the basis of Islamic Sharia, al-Shawkani did not prioritize the position of Ahl al-Bayt. Instead, he suggested further investigating the primary arguments (*dalil*) and not practicing blind *taqlid*.

Al-Shawkani was named *Shaykh al-Islam* because of his acknowledged scientific expertise in mastering various disciplines.[31] Indeed, al-Shawkani's thoughts on Hadith science are not as prominent, such as Ibn Hajar al-Atsqalani, Yusuf al-Qardhawi, Muhammad al-Ghazali, and other Hadith scholars. However, it does not mean that al-Shawkani is not competent to discipline hadith; he has an *imamat* degree in Hadith science when he seeks Hadith narrations by *talaqqi* with Hadith teachers.

His capacity in the discipline of Hadith is evident from his work, *Nayl al-Awtar,* which contains al-Shawkani's explanation of Ibn Taimiyyah's *Muntaqa al-'Ahbar*—which contains hadiths from *Sahih al-Bukhari, Sahih al-Muslim, Musnad Ahmad, Jami' al-Tirmidhi, Sunan al-Nasa'i, Sunan Abu Dawud,* and *Sunan Ibn Majah.* Al-Shawkani elaborated and explained the contents of the book. It is due to the encouragement of his teachers to provide more explanation, especially in determining the *rajih*

and *marjuh Hadiths.*[32]

Al-Shawkani does not emphasize the transmission of Hadith by Ahl al-Bayt narrators explicitly. Still, his comments on determining the validity of Hadith in *Nayl al-Awtar,* show how he stands for Ahl al-Bayt as a narrator. Al-Shawkani's criticism is not directed at the non-Ahl al-Bayt narrators. Still, he agrees with the validity of the hadiths by Ibn al-Hibban and others quoted by him—as the Hadith narrated by Abu Hurayra follows.[33]

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مَسْلَمَةَ، عَنْ مَالِكٍ، عَنْ صَفْوَانَ بْنِ سُلَيْمٍ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ سَلَمَةَ - مِنْ آلِ ابْنِ الْأَزْرَقِ - أَنَّ الْمُغِيرَةَ بْنَ أَبِي بُرْدَةَ - وَهُوَ مِنْ بَنِي عَبْدِ الدَّارِ - أَخْبَرَهُ أَنَّهُ سَمِعَ أَبَا هُرَيْرَةَ يَقُولُ: سَأَلَ رَجُلٌ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَقَالَ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، إِنَّا نَرْكَبُ الْبَحْرَ، وَنَحْمِلُ مَعَنَا الْقَلِيلَ مِنَ الْمَاءِ، فَإِنْ تَوَضَّأْنَا بِهِ عَطِشْنَا؛ أَفَنَتَوَضَّأُ بِمَاءِ الْبَحْرِ ؟ فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: "هُوَ الطَّهُورُ مَاؤُهُ، الْحِلُّ مَيْتَتُهُ"

Abdullah ibn Maslamah has told us—from Malik, from Safwan ibn Sulaym, from Sa'id ibn Salamah, from Ibn Azraq family, that Mughirah ibn Abi Burdah (from Bani Abd ad-Dar) has told him that he heard

---

30 Syarjaya.

31 Zainuddin, "Metode Kritis al-Shawkani," 92.

32 Zainuddin, 95-96.

33 Al-Shawkani, *Nayl al-Awtar, Juz I* (Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ikaiyah, 1994), 23.

Abi Hurairah narrates: Someone asked the Prophet, "O Messenger of Allah, at that time we were on a boat in the ocean and had only a little water, which if we used it to take ablution then we would be thirsty. Can we take ablution [*wudu*] with ocean water?" Rasulullah replied, "Water of the ocean is pure [*mutlaq* water], and their carcasses [fish and the like] are halal.

This Hadith was narrated by a companion, Abu Hurayra, alone from non-Ahl al-Bayt. In his book al-Shawkani, it is stated that al-Tirmidhi decided that this Hadith is a Sahih Hadith. Likewise al-Shawkani, because Ibn Hibban, Ibn Huzaimah, al-Hakim, al-Daruqutni, al-Bayhaqi, and Ibn 'Abi Shaybah also narrated this Hadith. Al-Shawkani also concluded that most Hadith experts determined it as a Sahih Hadith.[34] Al-Shawkani's thoughts on the hadith follow the Hadith scholars' provisions which did not prioritize the narrators of Ahl al-Bayt. This Hadith is an example that non-Ahl al-Bayt narrators are accepted as long as the *sanad* and *matan* complete the criteria formulated by Hadith scholars.

Al-Shawkani explains his formula in no detail. Still, the form of al-Shawkani's reliance on Hadith experts does not directly indicate that al-Shawkani agrees with the criteria for the validity of Hadith, which emphasizes not prioritizing the narrators of Ahl al-Bayt as determined by Shia.

Al-Shawkani's reference in *Nayl al-Awtar* also shows al-Shawkani's objectivity regarding the provisions of Hadith criteria. Al-Shawkani also does not choose references based on madhhabs; he is more focused on the books of credible Hadith experts. Al-Shawkani in *Nayl al-Awtar* takes references from various books of Hadith, fiqh, language, and history as well as the primary reference books *jarh wa at-ta'dil,* such as *Sahih al-Bukhari, Sahih al-Muslim, Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal, Sunan Ibn Majjah, Sunan Abu Daud, Sunan al-Tirmizi, Sunan al-Nasa'i, Sunan al-Daru al-Quthni,* Al-Nawawi's *Syarh Sahih Muslim,* Ibn Amir al-San'ani's *Subul al-Salam al-Mausulat ila Bulugh al-Maram,* Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani's *Fath al-Bari Sharh Sahih al-Bukhari, Talhis al-Hibir, Tahzib at-Tahzib, Lisan al-Mizan;* Ahmad ibn Yahya al-Murt's *Al-Bahr al-Zahhar fi Mazahib 'Ulama'i al-Amsar,* and others.[35]

In choosing Hadith references, Al-Shawkani uses many famous books such as *Sahih al-Bukhari* and *al-Muslim.* Al-Shawkani, based on the works of Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, who did not prioritize references from Ahl al-Bayt narrators, critics of Hadith transmission also wrote scientifically and objectively.

---

[34] Zainuddin, "Metode Kritis al-Shawkani," 97.

[35] Fauzi, "Metode Imam asy-Syawkani," 54.

In his book, *al-Fawa'id al-Majmu'ah fi al-Ahadith al-Dha'ifah wa al-Mawdhu-'ah*, al-Shawkani also defines the criteria for a Hadith. The book contains a collection of *dhaif* and *maudhu'* Hadiths in the same way as earlier *maudu'at* books, such as al-Majid's *Mukhtashar, Maqasid li al-Sakhawi,* Abd al-Rahman ibn Ali's *Tamyiz al-Thayyib min al-Khabith,* Ibn al-Jawzi's *al-Dzil 'ala Maudhu'at, Kitab al-Wajiz li al-Suyuti, Takhrij al-Ihya' li al-'Iraqi,* and *al-Tazkirah li ibn Tahir al-Fattani.*[36]

Al-Shawkani's book is written very concisely and arranged according to fiqh chapters so that it is easy to understand compared to other books on *maudhu'at* such as Ibn al-Jawzi's *al-Maudhu'ah,* Abi Hasan Ali ibn Muhammad al-Kannani's *al-Tanzih al-Shari'ah al-Marfu'ah 'an al-Akbar al-Sani'ah al-Maudhu'ah,* and others.

Al-Shawkani does not explain in detail the proper narrators (*'adalah*) in each Hadith, but he relies on his views from the authors' comments of the original book without adding al-Shawkani's opinion. Al-Shawkani chose the reference in determining a narrator in *jarh wa at-ta'dil* from the primary source of the naqd al-hadits, such as *Mizan al-I'tidal li al-Zahabi, al-Kamil fi al-Dha'fa' li ibn 'Adi,* and others.[37]

In determining a Hadith in his book, Al-Shawkani is not focused on a hadith narrator. Still, he is more focused on the peculiarities of the content of a hadith which will be used as the basis of Islamic Sharia.[38] The criteria for Hadith narrators about the *naqd al-sanad,* in al-Shawkani's work shows the reliance on the requirements for narrators on Hadith scholars. Al-Shawkani did not prioritize Ahl al-Bayt in this work because he did not write down his opinion or the comments of other scholars as supporting Ahl al-Bayt narrators or weakening non-Ahl al-Bayt narrators. Apart from that, al-Shawkani is also more focused on the peculiarities of the content of the Hadith (*matan*), which shows the objectivity of setting the criteria for a narrator. Thus, al-Shawkani does not appear fanatical and favors one of the madhhabs.

Al-Shawkani is very concerned about the quality of Hadith transmission because it influences the determination of Islamic sharia. Prioritizing Ahl al-Bayt narrators over non-Ahl al-Bayt is not objective thinking. This al-Shawkani's stance seems to agree with the four Sunni Madhhabs (Hanafi, Maliki, Shafi'i, and Ahmad)—even al-Shawkani also criticized some of the Zaydis who agreed with the Mu'tazilahs.[39]

---

[36] Masyhuri, Aziz, and Fatah, "Studi Komparasi Manhaj al-Syawkani," 109.

[37] Masyhuri, Aziz, and Fatah, 108-112.

[38] Masyhuri, Aziz, and Fatah, 112.

[39] Atabik, "Tarjih dalam Penafsiran," 301.

One of al-Shawkani's *ijtihad* in understanding Islamic sharia is interpreting verses of the Qur'an with Hadith. Al-Shawkani, in his *tarjih* for the Qur'an, uses Sahih Hadith based on Hadith scholars' consideration. For example, he commented on interpreting the word "*al-mauqudhah*" in surah al-Maidah [5]: 3.[40]

حُرِّمَتْ عَلَيْكُمُ ٱلْمَيْتَةُ وَٱلدَّمُ وَلَحْمُ ٱلْخِنزِيرِ
وَمَآ أُهِلَّ لِغَيْرِ ٱللَّهِ بِهِۦ وَٱلْمُنْخَنِقَةُ وَٱلْمَوْقُوذَةُ
وَٱلْمُتَرَدِّيَةُ وَٱلنَّطِيحَةُ وَمَآ أَكَلَ ٱلسَّبُعُ إِلَّا مَا
ذَكَّيْتُمْ ...

Prohibited to you are dead animals, blood, the flesh of swine, and that which has been dedicated to other than Allah, and [those animals] killed by strangling or by a violent blow or by a head-long fall or by the goring of horns, and those from which a wild animal has eaten, except what you [can] slaughter [before its death]...

According to Ibn Abd al-Bar and Ibn Uma, al-Shawkani explains several opinions on the prohibition (*haram*) of eating animals hunted with slingshots, stones, and blunt tools. Another view, according to the Kuffah people, such as Abu Darda', Faddhallah ibn Ubaid and Abdullah ibn Umar, is permissible to eat it (*halal*).[41] Al-Shawkani includes a hadith narrated by Adi ibn Hatim (non-

Ahl al-Bayt), which supports the first opinion.[42]

حَدَّثَنَا إِسْحَاقُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ الْحَنْظَلِيُّ، أَخْبَرَنَا
جَرِيرٌ، عَنْ مَنْصُورٍ، عَنْ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، عَنْ هَمَّامِ
بْنِ الْحَارِثِ، عَنْ عَدِيِّ بْنِ حَاتِمٍ، قَالَ قلت
يا رسول الله، إني أرمي بالمعراض الصيد
فأصيب، فقال: إذا رميت بالمعراض فخرق
فكله، وإن اصاب بعرضه فإنما هو وقيذ فال
تأكله.

Ishaq bin Ibrahim al-Hanzali has told us, has told us Jarir, from Mansur, from Ibrahim, from Hammam ibn Haris, 'Adi ibn Hatim: I said, "O Messenger, I actually threw a game animal with wood and then hit it." Rasulullah said, "If you throw it with a club so that it hurts, then eat it, and if it gets hit by the blunt part, then it dies from the blow, so don't eat it."

With this Hadith, al-Shawkani does I these opinions on the condition that what is permissible (*halal*) is that the animal is only injured or does not kill it. It means that the injured animal is then slaughtered, and *haraam* is an animal that dies not because it was slaughtered, such as from being shot by an arrow or the like that killed before being slaughtered. Al-Shawkani uses the Hadith, referring to *Sahih al-Bukhari* and *al-Muslim*, without commenting on the

---

[40] Atabik, 303.

[41] Atabik.

[42] Al-Syawkani, *Fath al-Qadir al-Jami' baina Fannai ar-Riwayah wa ad-Dirayah min 'ilm at-Tafsir, Vol. 1* (Beirut: Dar Ibn Hazm, 2014), 14.

validity of the Hadith. It means that al-Shawkani agrees with the authenticity of the Hadith by al-Bukhari and al-Muslim, which in no way prioritize the Ahl al-Bayt narrators as the Shiites.

Conclusion

Al-Shawkani considers the position of Ahl al-Bayt narrators more objectively by following the criteria of *naqd al-sanad* and *matan*, as the Hadith scholars determined. In several of his books, al-Shawkani focuses more on the peculiarities of the contents of the Hadith (*matan*). Because of this, al-Shawkani tends not to be fanatical or to side with one madhhab. This view relates to efforts to purify sharia by al-Shawkani against the people of his time by forbidding blind *taqlid*.

In *Nayl al-Awtar*, al-Shawkani chooses references from *mu'tabarah* Hadith collection books. It means that al-Shawkani does not directly agree with the validity criteria and the *jarh wa al-ta'dil* method decided by Hadith experts.

Al-Shawkani's *ijtihad* in understanding a basis of Islamic law is carried out by performing *tarjih* of the Qur'an verses with Hadiths—as in his work, *Fath al-Qadir al-Jami' baina Fannai al-Riwayah wa al-Dirayah min 'Ilm al-Tafsir,* using Sahih Hadith narrations from non-Ahl al-Bayt narrators who are referred to in the books of *Sahih al-Bukhari* and *al-Muslim.*

Bibliography

Al-Shawkani, Muhammad Ali. *Irsyadul Fuhul ila Tahqiqi min Ilmi al-Wushul, Juz I.* Riyadh: Dar al-Fadhilah, 2000.

_____. *Fath al-Qadir al-Jami' baina Fannai ar-Riwayah wa ad-Dirayah min 'Ilm at-Tafsir.* Beirut: Dar Ibn Hazm, 2014.

_____. *Nayl Awtar.* Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ikaiyah), 1994

Atabik, Ahmad. "Penafsiran al-Shawkani terhadap Ayat-ayat Aqidah." *Hermeneutik: Jurnal Ilmu al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 10, no 1 (2016): 155-169. DOI: 10.21043/hermeneutik.v10i1.3907.

_____. "Tarjih dalam Penafsiran al-Qur-'an Prespektif Imam asy-Shawkani dalam Tafsir asy-Shawkani." *Hermeneutik: Jurnal Ilmu al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 9, no. 2 (2016): 287-312, DOI: 10.21043/hermeneutik.v9i2.873.

Faudah, Mahmud Basuni. *Tafsir-tafsir al-Qur'an Pengenalan dengan Metodologi Tafsir.* Bandung: Pustaka, 1987.

Fuqohak, Zuhurul. "Riwayat Ahli Bait dalam Dunia Tafsir: Studi Komparasi Tafsir ar-Riwa'i dan Tafsir bi al-Ma't." *Heurmeneutik: Jurnal Ilmu al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 13, no. 1 (2019): 1-17. DOI: 10.21043/hermeneutik.v13i1.5523.

Imran, Muhammad. "Sahabat Nabi SAW. dalam Perspektif Sunni dan Shi'ah: Pengaruhnya pada Kesahihan Hadis." *Aqlam: Journal of Islam and Plurality* 1, no. 1 (June 2016): 27-28. DOI: 10.30984/ajip.v1i1. 497.

Moklis, Nur. "Studi tentang Pemikiran Imam al-Shawkani dalam Kitab *Irsyad al-Fuhul.*" Accessed June 21, 2023. https://www.academia.edu/41609815/STUDI_TEN-TANG_PEMIKIRAN_AL_SHAW-KANI_DALAM_IRSYAD_AL_FUHUL.

Muis, Moch. Zulkarnain. "Ihdad dalam Hukum Islam: Studi Komparasi Pemikiran Imam al-Bajuri dan Imam al-Shawkani." *Ma'mal: Jurnal Laboratorium Syariah dan Hukum* 3, no. 03 (June 2022): 198–216. DOI: 10.15642/mal.v3i3.137.

Mukarramah, Achmad. "Fath al-Qadir Karya al-Imam al-Shawkani: Suatu Kajian Metodologi." *Thesis*, UIN Alauddin Makassar, 2015.

MZ, Zainuddin. "Metode Kritis al-Shawkani dalam Kitab Nayl al-Awtar." *Islamica* 3, no. 2 (March 2009): 90-100. DOI: 10.15642/islamica.2009. 3.2.90-100.

Nasrun Rusli. *Konsep Ijtihad asy-Syawkânî dan Relevansinya dengan Pembaharuan Hukum di Indonesia.* Jakarta: Logos, 1999.

Nasution, Harun. *Teologi Islam: Aliran-Aliran Sejarah Analisa Perbandingan.* Jakarta: UI Press, 1983.

Rifai, Masyhuri, Muhammad Abd Aziz, and Fariz Risky Fatah. "Studi Komparasi Manhaj al-Shawkani (Fawaid al-Majmu'ah fi al-Ahadis al-Maudu'ah) dan al-Idlibi (Naqd al-Matn; 'Inda 'Ulama al-Hadis an-Nabawi)." *Zawiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 7, no. 1 (July 2021): 101-120. DOI: 10.31332/zjpi.v7i1.2900.

Rizal, Fauzi. "Metode Imam asy-Shawkani dalam Menyusun Kitab Nailul Autar Syarh Muntaqal-Akhbar." *Studi Multidisipliner: Jurnal Kajian Keislaman* 5, no. 2 (2018): 41-55. DOI: 10.24952/multidisiplinerv5i2. 1113.

Syarjaya, H.E. Syibli. "Pemikiran Ushul Fiqh al-Shawkani Telaah terhadap Kitab Irsyad al-Fuluhul ila Tahqiq min Ilm al-Ushul." *Jurnal al-Qalam* 24, no. 3 (2007): 352-362. DOI: 10.32678/alqalam.v24i3.1663.